

1 DIANE J. HUMETEWA
2 United States Attorney
3 District of Arizona
4 SHELLEY K.G. CLEMENS
5 Assistant U.S. Attorney
6 Oklahoma State Bar No. 16567
7 United States Courthouse
8 405 W. Congress Street, Suite 4800
9 Tucson, Arizona 85701
10 Telephone: 520-620-7300
11 Email: shelley.clemens@usdoj.gov
12 Attorneys for Plaintiff

13
14
15 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
16
17 DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

18 United States of America,
19 Plaintiff,
20 v.
21 Christopher Matthew Clements
22 Defendants.

23 CR 08-0303-TUC-DCB(CRP)

24
25
26
27
28 GOVERNMENT'S RESPONSE TO
DEFENDANT'S OBJECTION TO
REPORT AND
RECOMMENDATION OF
MAGISTRATE RE: SUPPRESSION
MOTIONS

29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000
1001
1002
1003
1004
1005
1006
1007
1008
1009
1000
1001
1002
1003
1004
1005
1006
1007
1008
1009
1010
1011
1012
1013
1014
1015
1016
1017
1018
1019
1010
1011
1012
1013
1014
1015
1016
1017
1018
1019
1020
1021
1022
1023
1024
1025
1026
1027
1028
1029
1020
1021
1022
1023
1024
1025
1026
1027
1028
1029
1030
1031
1032
1033
1034
1035
1036
1037
1038
1039
1030
1031
1032
1033
1034
1035
1036
1037
1038
1039
1040
1041
1042
1043
1044
1045
1046
1047
1048
1049
1040
1041
1042
1043
1044
1045
1046
1047
1048
1049
1050
1051
1052
1053
1054
1055
1056
1057
1058
1059
1050
1051
1052
1053
1054
1055
1056
1057
1058
1059
1060
1061
1062
1063
1064
1065
1066
1067
1068
1069
1060
1061
1062
1063
1064
1065
1066
1067
1068
1069
1070
1071
1072
1073
1074
1075
1076
1077
1078
1079
1070
1071
1072
1073
1074
1075
1076
1077
1078
1079
1080
1081
1082
1083
1084
1085
1086
1087
1088
1089
1080
1081
1082
1083
1084
1085
1086
1087
1088
1089
1090
1091
1092
1093
1094
1095
1096
1097
1098
1099
1090
1091
1092
1093
1094
1095
1096
1097
1098
1099
1100
1101
1102
1103
1104
1105
1106
1107
1108
1109
1100
1101
1102
1103
1104
1105
1106
1107
1108
1109
1110
1111
1112
1113
1114
1115
1116
1117
1118
1119
1110
1111
1112
1113
1114
1115
1116
1117
1118
1119
1120
1121
1122
1123
1124
1125
1126
1127
1128
1129
1120
1121
1122
1123
1124
1125
1126
1127
1128
1129
1130
1131
1132
1133
1134
1135
1136
1137
1138
1139
1130
1131
1132
1133
1134
1135
1136
1137
1138
1139
1140
1141
1142
1143
1144
1145
1146
1147
1148
1149
1140
1141
1142
1143
1144
1145
1146
1147
1148
1149
1150
1151
1152
1153
1154
1155
1156
1157
1158
1159
1150
1151
1152
1153
1154
1155
1156
1157
1158
1159
1160
1161
1162
1163
1164
1165
1166
1167
1168
1169
1160
1161
1162
1163
1164
1165
1166
1167
1168
1169
1170
1171
1172
1173
1174
1175
1176
1177
1178
1179
1170
1171
1172
1173
1174
1175
1176
1177
1178
1179
1180
1181
1182
1183
1184
1185
1186
1187
1188
1189
1180
1181
1182
1183
1184
1185
1186
1187
1188
1189
1190
1191
1192
1193
1194
1195
1196
1197
1198
1199
1190
1191
1192
1193
1194
1195
1196
1197
1198
1199
1200
1201
1202
1203
1204
1205
1206
1207
1208
1209
1200
1201
1202
1203
1204
1205
1206
1207
1208
1209
1210
1211
1212
1213
1214
1215
1216
1217
1218
1219
1210
1211
1212
1213
1214
1215
1216
1217
1218
1219
1220
1221
1222
1223
1224
1225
1226
1227
1228
1229
1220
1221
1222
1223
1224
1225
1226
1227
1228
1229
1230
1231
1232
1233
1234
1235
1236
1237
1238
1239
1230
1231
1232
1233
1234
1235
1236
1237
1238
1239
1240
1241
1242
1243
1244
1245
1246
1247
1248
1249
1240
1241
1242
1243
1244
1245
1246
1247
1248
1249
1250
1251
1252
1253
1254
1255
1256
1257
1258
1259
1250
1251
1252
1253
1254
1255
1256
1257
1258
1259
1260
1261
1262
1263
1264
1265
1266
1267
1268
1269
1260
1261
1262
1263
1264
1265
1266
1267
1268
1269
1270
1271
1272
1273
1274
1275
1276
1277
1278
1279
1270
1271
1272
1273
1274
1275
1276
1277
1278
1279
1280
1281
1282
1283
1284
1285
1286
1287
1288
1289
1280
1281
1282
1283
1284
1285
1286
1287
1288
1289
1290
1291
1292
1293
1294
1295
1296
1297
1298
1299
1290
1291
1292
1293
1294
1295
1296
1297
1298
1299
1300
1301
1302
1303
1304
1305
1306
1307
1308
1309
1300
1301
1302
1303
1304
1305
1306
1307
1308
1309
1310
1311
1312
1313
1314
1315
1316
1317
1318
1319
1310
1311
1312
1313
1314
1315
1316
1317
1318
1319
1320
1321
1322
1323
1324
1325
1326
1327
1328
1329
1320
1321
1322
1323
1324
1325
132

1 or directed to the side of the building. (RT. 05/05/08, P. 20, 57, 71, 72.) The encounter was
2 a consensual encounter and not an interrogation.

3 **II. ARGUMENT AND AUTHORITY**

4 In his objections, the defendant asserts that his arrest, as well as any evidence derived
5 the encounter with law enforcement was an unlawful seizure by law enforcement. The
6 defendant further argues that any statements made by him during the police contact on
7 October 5, 2007, should be suppressed as they were the product of a custodial interrogation
8 and subject to *Miranda* restrictions.

9 First, the defendant's identity cannot be suppressed, regardless of the legality of the
10 encounter. Second, the contact with the defendant was a consensual, non-custodial encounter
11 to determine his identity and nexus to the structure they had under surveillance. And finally,
12 once the defendant provided false information to the officer, he committed a new offense in
13 the officer's presence which gave the officers reasonable suspicion to detain him in order
14 to satisfy their suspicions, as well as probable cause to place him under arrest for a state
15 charge of giving false information to a law enforcement officer.

16 **A. THE DEFENDANT'S IDENTITY IS NOT SUPPRESSIBLE.**

17 The defendant makes many suppositions regarding the intent of the officers, but he
18 provides no authority refute that the identity of a defendant "is never itself suppressible as
19 a fruit of an unlawful arrest." *United States v. Guzman-Bruno*, 27 F.3d 420, 421 (9th Cir.
20 1994). In addition, an officer can ask an in-custody defendant for identifying information
21 without first providing *Miranda* warnings. *Pennsylvania v. Muniz*, 496 U.S. 582, 601
22 (1990); *United States v. Perez*, 776 F.2d 797, 799 (9th Cir 1985). Even if the defendant were
23 in custody during any part of the contact with law enforcement, neither his identity or any
24 statements from him regarding his identity could be suppressed.

25 ///

26 ///

27

28

1 **B. THE STATEMENTS OF THE DEFENDANT ARE ADMISSIBLE AS PART OF**
2 **A CONSENSUAL, NON-CUSTODIAL, ENCOUNTER.**

3 The government also seeks to introduce evidence that the defendant provided two false
4 names, as well as finally admitting his correct identity, while speaking with the officers. The
5 defendant argues that these statements were the result of a custodial interrogation sans
6 *Miranda*, and therefore inadmissible. In his Objections to the Magistrate's Report and
7 Recommendation, the defendant states that the court must focus on whether "the officers
8 knowingly made a show of authority to Mr. Clements inside the convenience store," to
9 support his assertion as to why the defendant did not feel he was free to leave. However, that
10 is not the appropriate inquiry.

11 It is well established that the Fourth Amendment is not implicated when law enforcement
12 officers merely approach an individual in public and ask him if he is willing to answer
13 questions. *See Muehler v. Mena*, 544 U.S. 93, 101, 125 S.Ct. 1465, 161 L.Ed.2d 299 (2005);
14 *see also Florida v. Royer*, 460 U.S. 491, 497, 103 S.Ct. 1319, 75 L.Ed.2d 229 (1983); *United*
15 *States v. Mendoza-Cepeda*, 250 F.3d 626, 628 (8th Cir.2001). *See also Orhorhaghe v. INS*,
16 38 F.3d 488, 494 (9th Cir.1994). In addition, in order for a statement to be inadmissible
17 pursuant to *Miranda*, the statement must be the result of a custodial interrogation. *Miranda*
18 *v. Arizona*, 384 U.S. 436, 86 S.Ct. 1602, 16 L.Ed.2d 694 (1966). Whether an individual is
19 in custody for purposes of *Miranda* depends on the totality of the circumstances at the time
20 the defendant is interviewed. *United States v. Allen*, 699 F.2d 453, 458 (9th Cir. 1982). A
21 trial court must determine if a reasonable person in the defendant's position would conclude
22 that he was not free to leave. *Id.* at 324; *United States v. Booth*, 669 F.2d 1231, 1235 (9th Cir.
23 1981). Neither a police officer's subjective intent nor a defendant's unusual susceptibilities
24 are relevant to the inquiry. *Stansbury v. California*, 511 U.S. 318, 323, 325 (1994). The
25 ultimate question, however, is whether there was "a formal arrest or restraint on freedom of
26 movement of the degree associated with a formal arrest." *Stansbury v. California*, 511 U.S.
27 at 325.
28

1 One would presume that any time an officer, particularly a uniformed one, approaches
2 someone in the street, that it would be known the officer is in a position of authority. That
3 does not necessarily mean that the encounter is custodial or that the defendant made
4 any non-voluntary admissions. Officer Morin requested the defendant's assistance in
5 answering a few questions, and asked him if he would step outside. (RT 05/05/08 P. 56, 57.)

6 The defendant agreed. (RT 05/05/08 P. 57.) Officer Morin did not lay hands on the
7 defendant and remove him from the Circle K. (RT 05/05/08 P. 59.) The purpose of the
8 inquiry was to establish the defendant's identity, and to determine if he knew anything about
9 the location in question. (RT 05/05/08 P. 40, 46, 50.) As no time was the defendant
10 restrained or advised he could not leave until he was placed under arrest. As such, there was
11 no Fourth Amendment seizure.

12 In addition, since he was not seized until after the second false name was given, he was
13 not in custody. As such, any questions asked of the defendant up to that point were part of
14 a non-custodial, consensual encounter, and no Miranda warnings were required.

15 Even if the court determines that the defendant was "seized" once Officer Morin
16 admonished him of the consequences to tell the truth, at that point, Officer Morin would have
17 been justified from that point forward in detaining the defendant as part of a valid
18 investigatory stop. At that point, the defendant had given the officer false information in the
19 form of a false name, which was a violation of law. The officer would have been justified
20 in detaining the defendant as part of a *Terry* stop to determine what the defendant's true
21 identity was. *See United States v. \$25,000 U.S. Currency*, 853 F.2d at 1506-1507. From
22 that point, the detention, if any, lasted no longer than necessary to effectuate the purpose of
23 the detention, which was to determine the defendant's identity.

24 ///

25 ///

26 ///

27

28

IV. CONCLUSION

WHEREFORE, PREMISES CONSIDERED, the government respectfully requests that this court deny the defendant's Objections to the Magistrate's Report and Recommendation and adopt the magistrate's recommendation. The defendant's identity cannot be suppressed regardless of the legality of the contact with officers. In addition, there was not an unlawful seizure of the defendant as the contact with the defendant was consensual. His statements were made voluntarily and were the product of a non-custodial interview.

Respectfully submitted,

DIANE J. HUMETEWA
United States Attorney
District of Arizona

S/ *Shelley K.G. Clemens*
SHELLEY K.G. CLEMENS
Assistant U.S. Attorney

Copy of the foregoing served electronically
or by other means this 2nd day of July, 2008, to:

John Kaufmann, Esq.
Attorney for the defendant

28